

School of Architecture Response to Budget Planning Committee Report REVISED October 9, 2020

Bill Chapman, Interim Dean

Budget Committee Proposal

The Budget Planning Committee proposal of August 20, 2020 was to merge the School of Architecture (SOA) with the College of Engineering. Although the first line recognizes the strong support for the School of Architecture in the community and suggests there may be “concern and resistance among some,” it fails to adequately identify the school’s unique standing. Unlike nearly every other school or college summary, the matrix neglects to describe the school’s present make-up and programs. Rather, the School of Architecture’s degree programs are shown in a list of programs in the College of Engineering. This establishes a sense of a *fait accompli*, in which the concerns of the school, its students, and its many supporters are not part of the reorganization process. The present plan, in fact, would effectively reduce the School of Architecture to the status of a department despite retaining the name of “School.”

Requirements for Autonomy

A key issue for the school and the larger community is the need for relative autonomy. A change in administrative structure will immediately trigger notices to our two accrediting organizations, NAAB and LAAB. Both organizations highlight the need for an accredited school to be the “master of its own destiny.” This would mean an executive level (now an EM-3 interim dean standing in for a dean), typically selected through a national or international search, direct access to higher levels of the university’s administration, representation at high-level university meetings, control over the unit’s finances, staff, and faculty and a well-defined process for recruitment, retention, and tenure and promotion of faculty members. An accredited unit also should have control over its budget, its admissions, and its alumni relations and fund-raising.

School Strengths

The School of Architecture occupies an important place in the state of Hawai‘i and has an international reputation for excellence and innovation. It is the only accredited school of architectural education in the state. The school is also home to the only NAAB recognized Doctor of Architecture degree (DArch) and stands at the forefront of architectural practice in the Asia Pacific Region. The school’s Master of Landscape Architecture (MLA) degree is well on the path to final accreditation, making it also the only accredited program in Hawai‘i. It is also the only program located in a tropical environment, which gives it a unique position amongst US institutions.

In addition, the school’s dual-degree Global Track (GT) program extends the school’s influence abroad and allows students an opportunity to gain a Master of Architecture (MArch) degree from our partner institution, Tongji University in Shanghai, while

completing their DArch at UHM. This is a highly valued program and connection, providing opportunities for engagement with international architectural firms and attracting students from throughout the US and world.

The School of Architecture also hosts a successful research arm in the form of the University of Hawai'i Community Design Center (UHCDC). The School of Architecture established the UHCDC as a new model for a university-based, built environments practice: a public-sector platform for multi-disciplinary collaboration. This public-interest orientation generated \$4 million in state funded "proof of concept" work involving 47 contracts with 12 state agencies and 4 non-profit organizations. UHCDC's novel "top-down bottom-up" approach, which strengthens connections between government and communities, recently earned both the 2020 national AIA/ACSA Practice & Leadership Award and a 2020 ACSA Collaborative Practice award. UHCDC has engaged 12 of 15 full-time School of Architecture faculty members, and over 20 faculty members across six university departments. Participating faculty members integrated projects into 29 courses in architecture, landscape architecture, planning, engineering, and the social sciences, engaging hundreds of students on statewide efforts to address housing, transportation, infrastructure, sea level rise, coastal management, food, waste, energy, incarceration, and education, among other topics. UHCDC provides roughly \$100,000 in student employment each year and has cumulatively offered students and new graduates nearly 20,000 hours of AXP credit applicable to architectural licensure. In addition to its project portfolio, the center has hosted 12 outreach events that have gathered our students, faculty, local and global practitioners, civic leaders, and the broader community around the critical built environment issues facing Hawai'i.

School History

The School of Architecture's origins stretch back to 1946, with the creation of a Pre-Architecture program offered in the College of Applied Science. In 1965, this became a four-year degree. Two years later, the BA in Pre-Architecture was renamed a BFA in Environmental Design; and shortly afterward, the university's College of Arts and Sciences started a new Department of Architecture, creating a MArch degree in 1971. A BArch followed in 1976. The National Architectural Accrediting Board (NAAB) accredited the BArch in 1978, and in 1980 a newly established School of Architecture conferred its first BArch degree.

In 1996, the school earned full-term NAAB reaccreditation for both its professional BArch and professional MArch degrees. The school offers the only accredited U.S. architecture degree in the Asia-Pacific region. In 1999, the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa proposed the country's first professional doctorate in architecture, now called the DArch degree. In 2004, NAAB recognized the Doctor of Architecture degree as a professional architecture degree, and further approved the school's accreditation retroactive to January 1, 2001, to be concurrent with the terms of accreditation for the school's Bachelor and Master of Architecture programs.

In the fall 2007, the school changed its nomenclature from Architectural Doctorate (ArchD) to Doctor of Architecture (DArch), in conformance with established NAAB professional degree titles. With the addition of the DArch, the school phased out the MArch degree 2005 and the BArch degree in 2007. Effective fall 2012, the faculty divided the continuous, seven-year DArch program into a 4-year, 120-credit pre-professional Bachelor of Environmental Design (BEnvD) degree and the 90-credit professional DArch: four plus three. The faculty completed the first full year of this new curricular structure in spring 2015.

The school modified the BEnvD curriculum in AY 2015–16, eliminating concentrations and crafting a sequence of more focused courses, partly tailored to the planning of a landscape architecture graduate degree. The school's 2010–11 Strategic Plan considered the creation of a Master of Landscape Architecture (MLA) program as one of its top curricular priorities. In October 2017, the BOR unanimously approved the MLA, which began in 2018 and achieved Landscape Architectural Accreditation Board (LAAB) candidacy status in 2019.

Community and Professional Support

Local architecture and landscape architecture professionals have been a tremendous resource for the school's degree programs. They serve as donors, supporters, advisory council members, guest critics in studios, guest lectures, mentors, and future employers. The school's part-time lecturer pool draws heavily from members of Hawaii's professional community. The MLA program has very strong support from the local chapter of the American Society of Landscape Architects (ASLA). The program director serves on the national ASLA's Board of Trustees, and a SOA assistant professor serves as president of the Hawai'i chapter.

The professional community has taken great pride in the independence of the school and sees the School of Architecture's status as a reflection of the regard of the state and university for the profession. Many local firms employ the School of Architecture's graduates; and many principals in local firms are UHM graduates themselves. Gift giving is a reflection of this loyalty; in 2014 the architectural community provided over \$200,000 to assist the then new dean, Daniel Friedman, in his efforts to expand and improve the school. This close-knit relationship between the architectural community and the School of Architecture remains a hallmark of the school's place in the state today.

Importance to the State and Region

The School of Architecture builds on the unique island context within the Hawai'i, Asia and Pacific region to promote design excellence, intellectual inquiry, creative problem solving, and multidisciplinary collaboration, with both local and global impact. Environmental designers, architects, and landscape architects are essential for a better future for Hawai'i, our country and planet.

Architects and landscape architects create the places where people live and learn, work, and play. They design hospitals that heal and houses of worship that sustain communities. They create next generation energy-saving buildings to make our communities healthier

and safer. All the while, architects work with clients and allied design professionals and construction partners to improve the built environment in a \$1 trillion sector that accounts for almost 6 percent of the economy.

UH's shared value of malama'aina, caring for living in harmony with the land—expressed in land stewardship and sustainable environmental design—lies at the core of both our architecture and landscape architecture programs. Both architects and landscape architects apply design and problem-solving skills in resource, water and land use planning, sustainability, applied ecology, as well as addressing cultural and social factors.

Architecture and landscape architecture also address the pressing needs of the present century. Both create environmental capital through the application of sustainable practices that respect and preserve our environment for future generations. Buildings and the infrastructure that supports them are a huge potential contributor to carbon emissions and environmental degradation. It is also clear that the appropriate design of new buildings and the retrofit of existing buildings can help in a very significant way to move us towards a better and more sustainable future. The pressing need to address climate change through building renovation and upgrading and through the construction of new higher performance buildings is in and of itself a significant economic driver due to the economic benefit of such capital expenditures.

Architecture and landscape architecture help to build financial capital by constructing assets that are not only beautiful and inspiring but are also durable and adaptable enough to retain their value. These design professions do this by producing buildings that consume increasingly scarce energy resources efficiently. In fact, in the best cases good architecture can be net zero or even net positive in energy terms... In other words, sustainable buildings can produce more energy than they consume.

Finally, good architecture, landscape architecture and design more generally help to attract and build human capital by providing environments that lift the human spirit and engage and empower communities to achieve their maximum potential.

Present Degree Offerings and Status of the School

- The School of Architecture presently offers the Bachelor of Environmental Design (BEnvD), the recently established Master of Landscape Architecture (MLA), and the accredited Doctor of Architecture (DArch). The MLA has achieved accreditation candidacy status in 2019. The BEnvD is in the last stages of seeking permanent degree status at UHM (Fall 2020).
- The Department has a Global Track DArch/MArch dual degree program with Tongji University in China. The Doctor of Architecture is the only program of its kind in the country.
- There are 203 enrolled in the BEnvD, 19 in the MLA, and 56 in the DArch.

- Faculty FTE is currently 12.92, down from 13.48 in Fall 2014. The faculty FTE includes two former deans, one who now serves as director of the Global Track program and one on special appointment with the Provost's Office.
- The interim dean holds tenure in American Studies, where he oversaw the Graduate Certificate in Historic Preservation. That program is currently struggling but could flourish in the School of Architecture. Of the twenty-five U.S. master's programs in historic preservation only one is in a school other than architecture. Courses in historic preservation are currently offered by lecturers. No other American Studies graduate course supports the certificate program. The faculty of the School of Architecture, however, would have to be consulted and agree to take on this program.
- Unlike professional degrees in Law and Medicine, the graduate programs in Architecture are under the Graduate Division.

Proposed New Degree Offerings

The School of Architecture has prepared a draft ATP for the Master of Architecture (MArch) degree, which would reduce the time to a professional architecture degree from 3 years (DArch) to 1.5 to 2 years (MArch) beyond the four-year preprofessional BEnvD. The trend in architectural education is away from the traditional professional BArch degree to a 4+2 (or in our case possibly 4+ 1.5) combined preprofessional bachelor's degree and two-year graduate professional degree. Currently 126 national programs have MArch degrees. Only 67 retain the BArch.

The faculty members have further discussed the creation of a Doctor of Design program to meet the needs professionals in a number of design fields, including architects with BArchs or MArchs. The School is considering a design-based, partially residential program that would bring mid-career professionals to UHM for two summer sessions but allow them to continue to maintain their careers where they are.

With its April 2019 Strategic & Action Plan, the school committed to researching what it would take to plan and implement dual graduate degree options in architecture (DArch/MArch) and landscape architecture (MLA) and landscape architecture (MLA) and urban planning (MURP).

A strategic relationship with other units, notably Planning (the Department of Urban and Regional Planning) and Engineering could result in new degrees that would contribute significantly to the campus' and school's offerings. These include a graduate-level program in Urban Design; a shared program with the College of Engineering in Construction Management; in addition to the potential MS in Historic Preservation. All of these would contribute to the school's growth and take advantage of existing courses and offerings.

Faculty, Staff and Community Response to the College of Engineering Option

The story of the School of Architecture (in the minds of alumni, faculty, and the community) is one of gradual growth and independence. A survey of the 136 NAAB accredited architecture programs indicates that only seven have a connection with engineering

programs in their titles. Even among these, the connection is tenuous: Tuskegee Institute has a College of Engineering, Architecture, and Physical Sciences, which would suggest this is a mere administrative grouping, not one with any degree of integration. Clearly this is not the direction that environmental design programs are taking around the country. In the 1980s, in fact, NAAB specifically cautioned against architecture programs associated with engineering colleges, putting them on notice for accreditation.

In contrast, numerous US precedents exist of highly ranked and successful units that house departments and/or programs of architecture, urban and regional planning and landscape architecture, for example the College of Environmental Design at the University of California at Berkeley or the University of Texas at Austin School of Architecture. At Arizona State, often cited as a model for our future, Architecture is located in a School of the Arts. Our latest NAAB review (2018) emphasized the importance of an independent school of architecture at UHM.

The SOA faculty and dean are opposed to the higher administration's suggestion to "combine the School of Architecture with the College of Engineering." A response prepared by the Architecture Faculty Senate (AFS) questioned the goals of the merger and queried whether the organizational changes would benefit the school and its programs. The AFS response disagreed with the characterization that "architects and members of the SoA arch advisory board" were supportive of the program, as the Budget Planning Committee proposal suggests. They further emphasized the potentially negative impacts on NAAB and LAAB accreditation. Most important, the faculty as a whole stated that:

the School of Architecture has a distinctly different mission and vision from Engineering. At the School of Architecture, our academic and professional focus is on design, place, people, culture, the environment, while the College of Engineering and its departments' expressed Mission Statements are largely technology and resources driven. It is also important to note the nature of the professional relationship between architects, landscape architects and engineers as interrelated but distinct.

The AFS also noted that cooperation and collaboration were still possible without an amalgamation of the units. The faculty members point to two architecture school positions that engage both architecture and engineering students. Faculty members have also taught studio projects combining architecture and engineering students; engineering faculty also have served as committee members for DArch students.

A series of meetings with local and national organizations suggests similar concerns. Hawaii's AIA Fellows expressed an apparently uniform opposition to the merger with the College of Engineering, emphasizing that "engineers work at the direction of architects, not the other way around" and that architecture is primarily a "design discipline" whereas engineering education focuses more on research than on the actual process of building construction. The Dean's Advisory Council in a special meeting on October 6 expressed similar objections to the merger. Members from throughout the US (as well as Korea and Singapore) emphasized that only certain programs in the College of Engineering involved architecture. They also cautioned that the school's diminished status as essentially a

“department” would hamper recruitment of both students and faculty and significantly lower the status of the school.

Meetings and discussions with the AIA Hawai‘i and the Maui and Honolulu chapters of AIA have elicited similar objections. A special meeting of the Hawaii ASLA resulted in a commitment to write a formal letter of concern. The alumni organization, the UHSAAA, is also preparing a statement of opposition to the merger. The informal grouping of the dean and former deans is preparing a statement and has scheduled a meeting with the Provost. Other members of the community have also expressed the intention of providing testimony and letters opposing the merger. Overall, despite the Budget Planning Committee’s statement that industry and community support for the merger idea, the actual response is one of strong opposition. As one advisory council member explained, it would be “the end of architectural education in Hawai‘i” and would severely hamper the school’s ability to attract students, faculty and professional commitments.

Architectural Education at Other Institutions

Historically, Architecture has been closely aligned with Fine Arts and Design. Notable examples include Harvard, Princeton and Cornell, which maintain these organizational connections. Architecture at Cornell, for example, is in the College of Architecture, Planning and the Arts. Of 136 institutions with accredited architecture programs, as few as seven have a close connection to colleges of engineering. Where the connection does exist, it is typically an administrative link in the university or institute’s organizational chart not a “merging” of programs and curricula as the proposed College of Engineering and School of Architecture merger suggests.

A model program for UHM to consider is the College of Environmental Design at the University of California at Berkeley. This program includes Architecture, City and Regional Planning, Urban Design, Landscape Architecture Real Estate Development, Sustainable Environmental Design and other programs. Architecture features a BA, and MArch, a Master of Advanced Architectural Design degree, an MS and Ph.D.

The College of Built Environments at the University of Washington is another model to consider. This unit has degrees in Architecture, Construction Management, Landscape Architecture, and Urban Design and Planning. Though Construction Management includes “engineering-like” courses, the College of Engineering remains an entirely separate administrative unit within the university.

Ohio State University appears on the surface to have an organization structure similar to that proposed by the Budget Planning Committee. However, the Knowlton School of Architecture Landscape and Planning has a strongly independent character, with an Executive Director and an Associate Director as well as separate department chairs for each unit named in the school’s title. The School of Architecture also retains separate billing in the university’s organizational chart.

Alternative Steps and Alignments

There are a number of possible directions that the Budget Planning Committee might consider:

First, the committee should consider developing a longer planning process to provide architecture and other units an opportunity to identify more advantageous alignments. Such a process would identify important synergies and potential for growth. This would layout the best directions for the School of Architecture, as a separate unit, as a lead unit for a new school or college, or as part of another UHM unit.

Scenario One: College of Environmental Design (Architecture, Planning, Art and Design)

Create a new college of design, incorporating several now separate design interests at UHM. This would include Architecture, Urban and Regional Planning, Art History, and the new design disciplines moving to the College of Arts, Languages and Letters (CALL). This would require considerable persuasion and a willingness to cooperate among the deans, departments and individual faculty members. Such a step would put us in league with many of the other leading design programs in the country, would enhance existing programs, encourage collaboration, and create new degree paths. It would also add to UHM's competitiveness for both grants and students, as well as faculty recruitment. The new school would require recruitment of a national leader in design education to serve as dean.

Scenario One would create a number of potential synergies among disciplines and programs. Painting, sculpture, glassmaking, printmaking, and graphics are subjects of interest to architecture students. The Art History program could participate in a possible Master of Architectural History program and truly put UHM on the map as a center for the study of the architecture of Asia and the Pacific. The connection between Architecture and Planning is already well established. We can assume these collaborations would be enhanced by the two units (now a school and a department) joining forces more closely. The combination would also provide the Urban and Regional Planning program with a ready-made undergraduate degree, the BEnvD, currently in the School of Architecture. Planning and Architecture could both provide support for a graduate program in Historic Preservation.

Such a combination would genuinely benefit all three areas (Architecture, Planning, Art). It would not eliminate a school but provide a more manageable, efficient unit with a significant critical mass and numerous opportunities for collaboration and cross-fertilization. A platform such as this would facilitate the development of other degrees: an urban design degree; an interior design program; historic preservation (beyond the certificate program). It would fill a number of state needs and those for expanding our reach beyond Hawai'i.

This Scenario would result in greater exposure for the design-related disciplines at UHM and an increase in enrollment, revenues, and collaboratively conceived grants.

Scenario Two: School of Architecture, Art and Design in the College of Arts, Languages and Letters (CALL)

To create a new school within the structure of CALL, combining Architecture with related visual arts and design programs. This scenario roughly follows that offered in Scenario One, with the exception of the Department of Urban and Regional Planning no longer part of the mix. The proposed school would bring together design-related disciplines and would exist as a quasi-autonomous unit within CALL. The proposed school would stand somewhat separate from the other departments, just as SPAS does in the current CALL organizational chart. The unit would be headed by an EM-2 Director, who would also serve as an Associate Dean in CALL.

Scenario Three: School of Architecture and Planning in the College of Social Sciences

Scenario Three offers a parallel to Scenario Two, with the difference being the immediate alignment would be with Planning rather than the Fine and Applied Arts. Presently, the Department of Urban and Regional Planning has no undergraduate degree, a healthy master's degree program, and a small Ph.D. program. A combined Planning and Architecture school within the College of Social Sciences (name TBD) would build upon existing alliances and offer numerous continued and new opportunities for collaboration and interdisciplinary teaching and research. Many current DURP faculty routinely serve on Doctor of Architecture committees, architecture and landscape architecture faculty serve on MURP capstone and thesis committees, PLAN 620 environmental planning is a required MLA course that brings planning and landscape architecture students together, DURP students register for various DArch/MLA electives and vice versa. A number of current DURP faculty hold professional architecture and landscape architecture degrees. Similar in structure to SOA's DArch and MLA degrees, the MURP is a professionally accredited degree (Planning Accreditation Board). Further, the American Planning Association (APA) is a professional sister organization of AIA and ASLA.

Again, the unit would be headed by an EM-2 Director, who would also serve as an Associate Dean in the college.