Senior Honor’s Project Proposal
Where Loyalties Lie, Imperial Sense of Self, Identity, Loyalty, and Nationalism in the 19th C.
Traitor Lords in Indo-Oriental States

A Senior Honors Project Proposal
Presented to the Faculty of the Department of History
University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements For Bachelor of World-Comparative History with Honors

By Devon Miller
05/16/2017

Committee: Prof. Marcus Daniel and Dr. Peter Hoffenberg
Mentor: Prof. Marcus Daniel
Table of Contents

Part One: Project Goals, Importance, and Background 2

Methodology 7

Literature Review 9

Conclusions 23

Project Timeline 24

Work Cited 25
Project Goals, Importance, and Background

This project will explore national, cultural, and imperial loyalty in the 19th century through three case studies. All three are military men, who, after deserting, integrated themselves into a foreign culture, and, capitalizing on their western identities, rose to military and political prominence within the new culture. I wish to establish to what extent these men saw themselves as agents of imperialism, and establish the extent to which ideals of loyalty affected their actions.

The original inspiration for this project was popular media. If one looks at modern media, it quickly becomes apparent that our society romanticizes the “white savior” trope and the idea of an individual ‘going native’. Our society’s fascination with both the topics of desertion and/or “going native” can be seen in films such as Lawrence of Arabia (1962), Dances with Wolves (1900), The Last Samurai (2003), James Cameron’s Avatar (2009), and Snowden (2016). I was curious to see if there was a historic precedent for this trope.

This phenomenon, fueled by a western fascination with the cultural myth of the “exotic orient” is a manifestation of the western fascination with the ‘other’. Covered by Edward Said in his work Orientalism, Orientalism, and the orient itself represent traits that Western culture feels it has lost to civilization and leads to the romanticisation of ‘native’ culture while maintaining a cultural boundary from the ‘savages’ and imperial cultural hierarchies. An explanation for the plethora of ‘White Savior’ tropes in modern and contemporary media, one could argue that western audiences attempt to regain or rediscover some aspect of the lost primal attributes by

---

1 Defined here as a Caucasian individual rescuing a group of another ethnicity from their trouble.
merging with the exotic ‘other’. Of course these cultures are often presented in the manner the west perceives them and thus are not ‘true’ reflections of the culture. The theme of nationalistic and cultural loyalty was incredibly important to a large portion of the 19th century western population and this has not changed today.3

My project focuses on three men: Jules Brunet, a French artillery officer of the Second Republic, who was deployed to Japan as a military consultant to the Shogunate in 1867. After defecting, Brunet helped form the Ezo republic, becoming second in command of the Ezo Army in 1868.4 The second is George Thomas, an English Sailor who defected from the East Indian Trade Company’s Navy and formed his own miniature Punjabi state from 1798-1801.5 The third is David Fagan, an African American soldier in the United States army. He defected in 1899 to the Philippine Revolutionary Army during the Philippine War of Independence and became a commanding officer in the Philippine Revolutionary Army.6

Case Studies Coverage Academic Coverage

Of the three men, , Fagan has received the most academic coverage, followed in order by Thomas and Brunet. Appearing as a case study in various academic papers regarding the

Francklin, William. Military Memoirs of George Thomas (Calcutta, 1803)
Philippine war of independence, Fagan is usually used to analyse the African-American military community through a social, racial, and cultural lens and to explore their place within the United States army during this time frame. Fagan’s prominence, in comparison to Thomas and Brunet, is most likely due to the comparatively recent time frame in which he lived, coupled with his tendency to send letters detailing his exploits to United States officials, which were kept and filed for his military trial. In the case of Fagan, it should be noted that the Filipinos, who had very established social-racial hierarchies, would have almost certainly have viewed him with contempt as an African American. The elite considered themselves vastly superior to black men such as Fagan, and he would have found it difficult to transfer his cultural capital, especially considering he was only a corporal at the time of his defection. Knowing this, he probably wouldn't have assumed he would automatically rise in the ranks, especially since evidence suggests he defected due to abuse from a superior. Yet, like the other case studies, he rose through the ranks to a commanding position. One must wonder if Fagan’s letters to US officials were linked to his sudden rise, as the blatant racism amongst the United States military was well known to the Filipino's. Was his promotion due to the Filipino Revolutionary Army attempting to prove a point?

---

7 Ngozi-Brown, Scot (42-53)
Ontal, Rene (119-130)
Robinson, Michael C. (68-83)
Russel, Timothy D. (197-222)
8 Robinson, Michael C. (70-83)
9 An United States Marine Corporal is a Non-Commissioned Officer. Upon joining the Philippine Army, Fagan was promoted to the rank of Captain. A Captain, in the United States Marine Corps, is considered a Commissioned Officer, and received 4 times the pay of a Corporal.
10 It would make sense to use Fagan as an example to spread dissent amongst coloured U.S. soldiers, the sudden promotion of a coloured man in stark contrast to the racist treatment in the U.S. military and in the U.S. at this time.
Thomas usually appears in academic studies as an interesting story or as part of a plethora of case studies regarding his theater of war.\textsuperscript{11} In comparison to Fagan he is a relatively obscure individual, and while he does feature in academic works about the Rajahs of India, is the topic of his own historic study, as part of an analyses of the impact of British Empire in India, as evidence of cultural transfer and as an interesting, if extreme example of going native, he features in fewer academic works than Fagan.

Brunet, when he appears, is often just a footnote, and there exists no biography on him in English, even in his capacity as a painter. When Brunet is analysed, he is often deployed as evidence of a modernizing Japan, or as an example of French Imperial foreign relations. The most extensive academic coverage of Brunet that I found being the work of Sims, where Brunet appears as part of a historical analyses of France’s 2nd Republic’s political policies towards Japan during 1854-95. Brunet appears in a brief account of what Sims dubs the “Brunet-affair”.\textsuperscript{12} Even here, Brunet appears as part of a larger narrative.\textsuperscript{13} We know he existed, but there are few easily accessible sources about him in English. In fact, Brunet’s military mission is mentioned far more often than he is, and when he is mentioned, it is often in this capacity as a member of this military mission.\textsuperscript{14}

\textsuperscript{11}Hennessy, Maurice N. \textit{The Rajah from Tipperary}. St. Martin's Press, 1972.
\textsuperscript{12}His defection and role in establishing the Ezo-Republic.
\textsuperscript{13}Sims, Richard.

Francklin, William
Compton, Herbert. \textit{A Particular Account of the European Military Adventurers of Hindustan, from 1784 to 1803}. Oxford University Press, 1892.
Colley, Linda (170-193)
Perez, Louis G.
Akamastu, Paul (218)
I want to understand why these men abandoned everything they knew and defected not only from the service to which they belonged but the country with which they identified to pursue careers and a life in an Asian culture. The aim of the project is to establish who these men were, what they held in common, and why they all undertook similar courses of action to become significant figures in a new culture. We must also recognize that nationalism as we understand it is a modern construct, and our understanding of these values are shaped by our contemporary mindframe. One must recognize that we ourselves are reflections of our society, and that societies evolve over time.

Did these men see their actions as a matter of cultural disloyalty? If one assumes these men did not abandon their culture, then what prompted them to insert themselves within another? Did they view themselves as disloyal? Did they feel more qualified given their supposed cultural superiority, hence the ascension to positions of authority? If the case studies were not imperial subversive renegades, then why, despite disagreements about how to advance the imperial agenda with superiors, did they emerge as agents of imperialism?

---


Elleray, Michelle. (164–173)

Post-French Revolution is when we begin to see the development of the emphasis on patriotism and loyalty to the nation within western political states.

For instance, Colley focuses on the construction, maintenance, and manifestation of the ‘British Identity’ during the 19th century in her work

Colley, Linda. (170–193)
Methodology

Primary sources will be accessed via archives. Sources which require translation, in particular Meiji-Japanese and French governmental documents will be translated by two Japanese translators that have agreed to assist me. For sources written in French, I will be translating them myself with assistance from two contacts in France and Belgium respectively. Autobiographies, letters, photos, paintings, memoirs, and other primary sources will be used to study Brunet, Fagan, and Thomas. Newspapers, journals, governmental documents, and court case files will be used to determine the public response to these men's actions. As for establishing accepted academic contemporary views on race, nationalistic and cultural loyalty, contemporary academic papers, journals, monographs, cartoons, images, correspondences will be used. Over the course of the summer I will access archives in the cities of York and Leeds. If (I chose to use fluent, native speakers due to the ambiguous nature of the Japanese language. An example of this ambiguity is due to the nature of Kanji, for instance, the Kanji for representing the word ‘Nomu’ can refer to a wide plethora of meanings based on context in which it is used including, but not limited to: ‘to drink’, ‘to consume’, ‘to pray’, and ‘to meditate’. Considering this, I thought it best to use someone used to dealing with these nuances in order to get the most reliable translation possible. See: Okakura, Kakuzō. The Book of Tea. Tokyo: Kodansha International, 1991. Print. 19 I am going to utilise governmental documents, literature, journals and other examples of contemporary media in order to develop an understanding of the academic and social environment in which these men lived. Like individuals today, these men were inevitably shaped by the environment in which they were raised. By understanding their developmental context, one can formulate an understanding of the most likely scenario for their motivations and thought processes. Journals, and the words these individuals wrote, will provide us with the most reliable ‘voice’ in which to understand these men’s understanding of the ideas of imperial, nationalistic and cultural loyalty, their place in them, and the extent these factors played in shaping their actions. Court transcripts from the trials of these men, governmental documents referring to them, and other contemporary media such as newspapers will inform us of how their peers understood the notions of loyalty, interpreted these men’s actions, and what values were important to the society in which they lived. This will provide us with further context for these individuals societal environments. Finally, contemporary literature will provide us with a reflection of the cultural environment in which these responses and reflections of the case studies actions were developed, providing us with the ability to interpret the responses accurately.)
possible I will be looking to access French archives in person, but if I will not be able to, online archives will suffice.\textsuperscript{20}

It is my intent that my project will use similar methods to Elleray and Colley, using primary sources such as journals and memoirs as well as newspapers and governmental documents to study them in context. I will rely heavily on primary contemporary sources as opposed to secondary sources. I plan to use the three case studies as a symbolic representation in order to discuss a wider narrative of imperial ideas of self, or self in an imperial context. I will look at the similarities and differences, this being the basis for interesting and engaging historical study. I will be using the cultural contemporary sources to study possible inspirations for their contexts. These individual’s desertion appears to be more profound than standard desertions, appearing to be desertions from colonial imperialistic cultural in addition to a military post. One must ask if this is truly the case, to determine to what extent these individuals were shaped by ideals of genetic and cultural superiority and operated on these ideals as imperial freelancers, who despite ‘going native’ were still determined to control or exploit native cultures.

\textsuperscript{20} Archival examples include: Almanach National: Annuaire official de la Republique Francaise, L’Annie politique, Dictionnaire Geographicque et Administratif de la France, Ministre des Affaires Itranghire. Documents Diplomatiques Frangais, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Annuaire des services d'archives (Archives de France) and, Annales du Senat et du corps legislatif.
Literature Review

*Criminal Analysis Lens:*

For analysing the acts of these men, one must recognize that according to martial law, they all committed a crime in the act of disobeying military orders or deserting their posts. For this reason, I looked to criminology and its approach to the study of desertion to see the various methods used to study possible motivations of these men, as well as to give a wider context to see how these men matched or fit into the demographic of military deserters, as I wanted to see if they were unique or if there was any shared ‘typical’ motive and course of actions. I also want to understand how desertion trials typically played out in case studies respective nations, in order to determine what was the predominate focus of the trials and what was given more precedence in regards to criminality: breach of contract, treason to the state, cultural/racial treason, or perhaps these court martials operated simply as deterrent in an attempt to limit desertion rates, and were not representative of a nations condemnation of the idea of ‘disloyalty’. In order to establish how ‘typical’ my case studies were in the wider demographic of military deserters, the works of Woodbury and Carmichael are particularly useful. It should be noted that my case studies do not seem to fit the profile of a typical military deserter, so further studies need to be done to place them in context.

With works involving desertion, there is a large proportion which analyses the act in light of its denotation as a crime. These criminal studies fall more into the category of criminology rather than historic analysis. With that being said, they often deploy historic analysis to place the criminal analysis in its proper context. An example of this is the work of E.N. Woodbury,
who’s criminology paper focuses on military desertion with a predominate focus on criminal motives.\textsuperscript{21}

Woodbury’s work focuses on the motive behind the crime. Woodbury points out himself that this topic is often largely ignored by historians, and social sciences alike, stating that “modern criminal science has thus far neglected completely this.”\textsuperscript{22} Woodbury studies desertion in its context, in this case implementing historical analysis to review the crime, focussing predominantly on desertion without leave. By breaking down the crime, and looking at statistics, Woodbury takes an empirical approach in order to analyse the situations and motivations most likely to cause desertion and establish what a society considers a crime. A similar take on the criminal analyst lens is the work of Peter Carmichael, who instead focuses on the aftermath of the crime rather than the initial motives. Carmichael focuses on the punishment deserters received and how these punishments developed. While his work does differ from Woodbury’s, Carmichael similarly attempts to establish what inspired these men to commit the crime of desertion.\textsuperscript{23}

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{Woodbury213-222} Woodbury, E. N. (213-222)
\end{thebibliography}
**Desertion in the Social/Cultural Lens**

A common trend in historic analysis is to look at desertion in light of the social, political, and personal context in which it occurred. Most academic work seeks to understand the context behind the act of desertion and/or going native. Notably, very few of these actively engage in academic discourse, perhaps in part due to the relative scarcity of sources, a fact that is agreed upon within the sources which contain a thorough literature review.

The actions of Fagan, Brunet and Thomas do not appear to fit the expected narrative of Imperial interaction with other states. Thomas, Brunet and Fagan all act as agents of imperial and national subversion, despite betraying their nation by breaching their military contract and sometimes even defying the immediate interests of their nation, these men are treated with interest and even adoration by some members of the population such as Fagan’s popularity amongst his fellow African Americans, or Brunet’s reception in France as a hero following his return from Japan. In order to study the popular reaction to these men's actions the work of Beverly Schwartzberg, Andrew Plowman, and Douglas Peifer is useful as they analyse a society's reaction in order to draw conclusions about the society.\(^{24}\) Schwartzberg reviews the topic of desertion in relation to its impact on military, marital, pension, and dependent benefits within the United States Army during the American Civil War.\(^{25}\) Schwarzenberg’s analysing ‘going native’ and desertion in a cultural and/or social context utilising court documents and contemporary correspondents as her primary source of evidence in order to study the legalities of

---


\(^{25}\) Schwartzberg, Beverly (573–600)
marital law following a desertion. This particular example is indicative of a common trend of academic coverage of topics involving desertion and ‘going native’ discussing the idea of loyalty, in this case comparing the theme of patriotism and national loyalty to its relationship with domestic loyalty.26

This cultural analysis of desertion is also reflected in the work of Andrew Plowman. Plowman focuses on German deserters during WWII.27 Plowman utilises contemporary media representation and coverage of the crime of desertion to analyse the shift in the public's opinion of deserters in Germany. Thus, while Plowman focuses on the public reaction to desertion more than Schwarzenberg, both study the act of desertion within a cultural context and provide useful approaches to the study of desertion28

An alternate example of this type of analysis is Douglas Peifer’s work on German and British Pardon Campaigns after WWII analysing the shifting motivations the pardon campaigns in Britain and Germany in the period 1985-2006.29 Like Plowman and Schwartzenburg, Piefer’s

Carmichael, Peter S. (33-66)
Colley, Linda (170–193)
Francklin, William
28 Plowman, Andrew (377-395)
Shea, William L.
explores the topic of desertion as a way into a broader cultural history. In a similar manner I will look at the contextual literature and responses to these men’s actions during their ‘native’ stent and subsequent capture, exploring wider cultural issues to explore these individuals proclaimed understanding of their position in regards to the imperial understanding of loyalty, culture and identity. I plan to use elements of Piefer’s approach, bringing together various threads of literature to study the cultural context in which these men made their decisions in an attempt to understand the general mentality of this time period.

**Desertion: Biographical Lens/ Individual Impact:**

In a similar manner to what I hope to capture in my project, some historians write about the topic of desertion or “going native” through the eyes of the men who lived through it. This humanization of the acts arguably gives us the easiest method to develop a nuanced understanding of the personal, psychological, and cultural context which inspired the act. An example of this is the work of Judy Daubenmier, who wrote a biography of her great-grandfather, Gustav H. Schultz, an African American United States 7th Cavalry officer who deserted his post in what is now South Dakota in the early 1870’s. Her work goes into depth about her grandfather's unit, the 7th US Cavalry, his interactions and discusses to what extent these inspired his defection. Written in a narrative format, her work is perhaps more in depth then what I am planning, walking the reader through her subjects enlistment, defection, recapture and trials. She actively compares her grandfather's personal story and national myth,

30 Daubenmier, Judy. (2-17)
31 Daubenmier, Judy. (2–17)
and seeks to deromanticize the United States cavalry and military service, while humanizing the deserters. Daubenmier reveals that African American soldiers did not desert anywhere near as often as white soldiers did, which makes Fagan’s actions uncharacteristic for his demographic.\(^{32}\)

As a number of authors point out, deserters tend to be from minority groups in part because of discrimination at home.\(^{33}\) As my study is about how the case studies viewed and placed themselves within the idea of imperial national and cultural loyalty I want to see to what extent are they ‘typical’ of this demographic. Both Fagan and Thomas are members of a minority demographic; being African American and Irish respectively.\(^{34}\) I am curious to discover if Brunet falls into this category too. Unlike Daubenmier, I will not be seeking to justify these men's actions, but rather study and place their actions and motivations within their historical context.

---

\(^{32}\) Daubenmier, Judy. (12)
\(^{33}\) Anderson, Fred.
Agostini, T. (957-85)
Carmichael (33-66)
Colley, Linda. (170-193)
Daubenmier, Judy. (2–17)
Francklin, William.
Russell, Timothy D. (197-222)
Robinson, Michael C. (68-86)
Shea, William. and
Sunderland, Willard.

These individuals also tend to be easier to write about, whether it be an ingrained distaste for the "man" writing about these individuals sticking up for themselves acting as a form of projected catharsis, or perhaps it allows historians a degree of separation from their wards: it is easy to focus on a man who left because he was mistreated, as it makes for both a more sympathetic and interesting story. There is also a chance that contemporary authorities and peers would be far more likely to discuss defections from the “inferior” minorities, as there is a chance that this defecting behavior was expected, rather than an embarrassing footnote in history.

\(^{34}\) African Americans experienced blatant mistreatment and contempt at the hands of the United States military at this time. Often given the most dangerous or demeaning of posts and duties, they received little recognition of their service, or change in treatment upon returning home from active duty. The British Empire widely regarded the Irish naturally subversive. While officially recognized as part of the British Empire, historically, Ireland participated in a plethora of rebellions in attempts to establish independence from England, and often colluded with enemies of the English in the attempt. It should be noted that these rebellions were often brutally crushed by English, and later British forces.
An example of this infusion of a “minority narrative” with the topic of desertion is Thomas Agostini’s “Deserting His Majesty’s Service”. Agostini’s work focuses on an Irish defector, Robert Aensworth in 1757. Like my case study George Thomas, Aensworth was Irish. According to English contemporary views, Irishness was seen as subversive, and they were the stereotyped as deserters.\(^{35}\) Agostini’s work is very much an overview of the soldier's life, seeking to establish desertion rates and wider motivations which prompted the various desertions.\(^{36}\)

Romantic ideals of altruistic nationalism rarely inspired mercenaries or contractual soldiers before the French Revolution, and even after this desertion was often seen as an expected response to a breach in contract.\(^{37}\) A useful piece for me to study is Fred Anderson’s work on the everyday life of a British Imperial soldier, as it provides good material to compare to the Irish case study George Thomas. Anderson uses the journal of one of the defectors; depicting where they went, and how they escaped. He concludes that the main cause of desertion amongst the soldiers and mercenaries alike was a breach of contract, whether it be in time, supplies, wages, and prolonged service in hostile conditions, in this particular case winter, concluding that this would be expected as it was expected that the soldiers were fighting for a paycheck rather than patriotic nationalism.\(^{38}\)

Another example of this method is to use the topic of desertion in order to analyse soldier’s agency.\(^{39}\) Stephan Brumwell has a particular focus on the cultural identity of the British

---

\(^{35}\) Taussig, Agostini, T. (957-85)
\(^{36}\) Agostini, T. (957-85)
\(^{37}\) One must recognize that ideals of nationalism rarely inspired soldiers before the French Revolution, prior, and even after this period, soldiers were like any other profession, fighting for a contract.
\(^{38}\) Anderson, Fred
\(^{39}\) Similar to a cultural analyses, these works seek to establish the soldier’s humanity, and choices, and highlights how these men were products of the society where they came from, in this case industrial England.
American army and the individual agency of the soldiers that comprised it. This type of approach is also used to study desertions in the context of a disaster narrative, with historians depicting the act as one of the major contributing factors to a military loss or defeat. Peter Way for example, follows the story of the ‘regular and colonial troops’ of the British Empire during the 7 years war, with a particular focus at the garrison at Oswego. Here desertion is used to demonstrate of the soldiers agency, and as evidence of their ‘fight for authority’ and resistance against ‘unfair treatment’, acts which ultimately ended in ‘almost epic misfortune’. These studies will provide interesting sources to compare the actions of the three case studies to, predominantly George Thomas as they all cover 18th C. British Soldiers.

**Analysis of Going Native: Individual And Cultural**

When analysing the idea of going native, the question of imperial loyalty is made a focal point. The academic work which exists on this topic predominantly focuses on the idea of rebellion against society, or, societies reaction to this act of resistance. A particularly good piece which focuses on the this topic is the work of Michelle Elleray. Elleray analyses 19th C. Victorian ‘Beach Combers’ who ‘went native’ in the South Pacific. Elleray focuses on a single nation's perception of the cultural phenomenon. Michelle Ellery's work is useful as it brings up

---

40 Agency being defined as the ability of an individual to make their own free choices and act accordingly.

An example of this is Brumwell’s comparison, between the strategies the soldiers of the British American army employed to renegotiate their contracts and those used by the labour unions back in Britain. Brumwell notes that the strategies were almost identical, this being evidence that the occupation of soldiering was regarded, by the soldiers at least, as similar to other industrial occupations in regards to contractual expectations. It is very apparent that most of the soldiers posted to the British American army were there for the pay, and not for a sense of patriotic obligation.

the idea of these men acting as cultural mediators between imperial and indigenous cultures and highlights the fact that cultural disloyalty was often innately seen as racial disloyalty. Ellery uses a case study of one individual in order to analyse the cultural significance of the action, and interestingly Elleray chooses a religious figure whose intent was to ‘convert’ the natives. Elleray's work is particular interesting as it reveals that the British feared the idea of ‘going native’ as they inherently associated race, culture, and dress with morality, and the narrative of the converters being converted appears to be an important theme in both academic work and contemporary literature. This will be particular useful for analysing George Thomas and his actions in the Punjabi.

While Ellery’s work is an example of utilising a single individual's narrative as the focal point of a work of historic analysis, Mikail Mamedov’s work takes a different approach. Mamedov focuses on the idea of ‘going native’ in the context of Russian cultural identity and imperial consciousness in 1801-1806 and is a useful reference for developing questions for my project. Mamedov forgoes the emphasis on the individual narrative, and while he interweaves

---

42 The existence of contemporary literature about the topic is indicative that this question was as important and interesting to the contemporaries as it is today. The fascination with ‘going native is relative, to their culture and ours, and indicative of how prominent the notion of cultural and national loyalty was.


* Mamedov ‘analyze[s] [the] various and controversial manifestations of the phenomenon of Russia "going native" in the Caucasus: imitating natives, adopting local dress, borrowing other cultural practices.’ (Mamedov 275) Mamedov’s work is distinctive in that it seeks to explain why the process of
anecdotes into his work, he analyses ‘going native’ in the context of imperial consciousness, exploring why Russian occupiers adopted the customs of the ‘mountain men’ in the Caucuses.46

In a similar manner, Willard Sunderland explores the cross-cultural merging of Russian and Indigenous culture on the Eastern border of the Russian Empire.47 It is apparent that the expected outcome of these interactions was the ‘civilization’ of the ‘savage’ culture, with the imperial cultural being adopted wholeheartedly. The fact that Russian officials recognized the benefits of some aspects of steppe culture is indicative that this understanding was far from dominant amongst the imperial occupiers, an issue I will take up in my own work.48

Somewhere between Elleray and Mamedov is the work of Linda Colley, who utilises an approach somewhere between the cultural overview and individual case studies, and relies on a large collection of personalized anecdotes. Focusing on Europeans, primarily prisoners of war and defectors who ‘went native’ in South Asia. She explores national and cultural loyalties of these men. The idea of cultural loyalty is a common thread in both Colley and Elleray.49 Colley’s finds evidence that many of these defectors ‘cashed in’ on their western identities, using

‘going native’ was an “intentional and rational process” that was understood, and even somewhat accepted by Russian Imperial representatives, rather than a crime, cultural derangement or act of insanity. Exploring the establishment and development of a cultural identity, Mamedov uses a wide collection of personal narratives and archival sources.*

46 Mamedov, Mikail (275-295)
47 Both Sunderland and Mamedov explore why the indigenous culture was so readily adopted and assimilated is indicative that this was not the expected outcome of imperial-indigenous cultural encounters, which may be useful to my own work British, French, and American culture.
their technology, education and assumed superiority to achieve societal or monetary gain. This ‘trading in’ of the western identity suggests that defections may have occurred not because of cultural or national disillusionment or disloyalty, but because of the promise of a better economic or social position. Colley's work bears the greatest similarity to my proposed work, however, we differ in that my project studies a specific scenario, which while appearing in Colley’s work is not the focal point of the piece. Colley does mention George Thomas, however he is featured as more of a footnote than anything else. Colley is predominantly interested in the growth of 18th C. British nationalism. Historic analyses like that of Mamedov, Sunderland, Colley, and Ellery approach and analyse the topic of ‘going native’ as a social and cultural phenomenon, placing it in the context of an imperial culture.

**Going Native: Analysis through literature and cultural impact**

Imperial ideologies generally create a sharp boundary between Civilization and the ‘savage’ which can be seen in contemporary literature. By studying this literature, we can establish a society's perception of it’s values. There existed debate as to the extent to which this boundary between civilization and ‘savage’ was permeable. According to Imperial ideology, the boundary was indisputably impermeable. But the reality was far more complicated and the contemporary literature can help develop our understanding of popular perceptions and attitudes

50 Brumwell, Stephen. Colley, Linda. (170–193) and Campbell, I. C.
51 Camadell, Chappell, David A.
towards this idea of cultural permeability. I will study to what extent the case studies understood this dynamic and where they saw themselves within it. Like the aforementioned literature, I will explore Imperial identities and how these are deployed and rebelled against. These questions appear to have been as important to contemporaries as it is now. This can be seen in works of literature such as ‘Heart of Darkness’ and the movie ‘The Man Who Would Be King’, both of which cover the topic of ‘going native’, cultural and national loyalty, ‘falling into the void’ and colonial violence.\(^\text{53}\)

If desertion raises the question of national loyalty, going native highlights cultural loyalty. The topic of “going native” can be studied to assess cultural impact of the individuals who “went native” on the cultures they joined.\(^\text{54}\) I. C. Campbell, for example, uses a case study approach to analyze the impact that such individuals had on the culture they adopted while raising the question of the permeability of cultures. Campbell uses the narratives of eleven men who ‘went native’, contrasting the experiences and accounts of these men with the western literary depiction of the Pacific as a ‘paradise’. Exploring the relationship between these men and their adopted culture, Campbell pays special attention to their personalities and circumstances before and after ‘going native’. Campbell also analyses the Islanders attitudes towards these men.\(^\text{55}\) In a similar manner, David Chappell looks at the cultural and social role ‘beachcombers’ played in the islands where they resided and their role as cultural mediators.\(^\text{56}\)

\(^{53}\) ‘The man who would be king’, Conrad
Popular literature is often indicative of a society's values and understand of a social and cultural ideas, and thus will be used in the project to establish, in part, the case studies societal and cultural context.

\(^{54}\) This raises the question of adopting or assimilating into a foreign culture meant forsaking the original culture in the minds of the case studies. The way one impacts and operates within a new society can inform us of the individual's perception of their place within the new society.

\(^{55}\) Campbell, I. C.

\(^{56}\) Chappell, David A.
Another method used by Historians to study “going native’s” cultural impact is through contemporary literature analysis. An example of the literature lens form of historic analysis, Richard Slotkin analyses the topic of “going native” in order to discuss the effect the American Frontier had on encouraging violence both in literature and in de facto life. He explores the emergence of literary tropes in this period: captivity narratives and the ‘murderous hero trope’ and attempts to generate a better understanding of the colonial experience and literature of which “going native” played a predominant part in it’s formation. In a similar manner, I can use literature written in this period to understand contemporary understand the effects that contemporaries believed residing in the colonies had regarding the sense of self and loyalty. A more nuanced example of this particular method is Ebersole’s ‘Captured by Texts’ which has a focus on the religious significance of the captivity narrative in a similar manner to Elleray.

Within accounts of individuals who went native, those who did were sometimes seen as intermediaries and therefore special cultural figures; capable of flowing between both camps, acting as interpreters and negotiators.

Marryl, White

Interestingly, Richardson argues the frontier creates a new mentality: the “American soul: hard, isolate, stoic, and a killer.” This is an example of the belief that a location or environment can shape a person, here, the juxtaposition between civilization and wilderness creating the very identity of a nation.

58 Slotkin, Richard.
Colley, Linda. (170–193)
Elleray, Michelle. (164–173)
Chappell, David A.
Notably, vast sums of literature about ‘going native’ are innately tied into captivity narratives. (Derounian)
Slotkin builds upon the critique of Turner, arguing the idea of the American growing out the the union of European and Native cultures, creating a ‘best of both’ culture, also could explain this fascination with individuals who went native and returned, creating a new civilization with traits of both.
Ebersole uses the narratives in an attempt to deduce cultural assumptions, analyses changes in literary tropes to do so pre 1850, and seeks to establish clues about the society from these.\textsuperscript{59}

I am also curious what role women play within the story of my case studies. Usually they are a prominent reason for cultural shift, providing motivational factors such as love, money, trade, and survival. Often, western men who ‘went native’ or acted as intermediaries married native women, and not usually just for simply romantic reasons. Far more often, it was about gaining access to another culture, such as white traders who married Native American women to gain access to Native American trade networks, there marriage giving them a unique leverage within the indigenous population, with the women becoming the intermediaries endowing the outsider with cultural influence and power.\textsuperscript{60}


\textsuperscript{60} Marryl,White
Final Comments

The works I reviewed have a heavy reliance on interpersonal stories and a progressive narrative. While Piefer argues that this is due to the availability of these sources, I would add that this is also due to these sources being easier to engage with and interpret compared to purely empirical data, especially when one attempts to understand the nuances behind a very human experience. The issue of progressive narratives is that they often run the risk of creating a sense of inevitability. It is vital that when I conduct my study, I do so with the knowledge that motivations, cultural awareness, and self identity are very fluid and complex. Accordingly, all sources must be approached critically. Historians are drawn to personalized stories, often humanizing the subjects and makings them more sympathetic. It is important that I highlight the complexity of the case studies within my work and avoid convenient and oversimplified explanations. As I am using the case studies to study and explore the complex notions of 19th C. Imperial sense of self, loyalty, and nationalism I will need to understand what connected and differentiated these men, and if any set of shared events or contexts drove them to undertake similar actions in similar manners.
Time Table for Research:

June – August 2017

- Continuation research; locate secondary sources with Online archives/databases
- From the secondary sources, commence primary source search and review

June-July 2017

- Access libraries and archives at Leeds University, United Kingdom.
- Continue accumulating sources
- Conduct predominate bulk of research, utilizing and accessing the archives mentioned in the methods section of my proposal. Locate and analyses, with notes, 5 sources per week, with a weekly update sent to Prof. Daniel sent on Friday of each week.
- Cursory feedback will be implemented over the weekend. Goal of a total of 80 sources by the end of the summer semester with attached analysis. At the end of each month, online discussion with mentor to receive suggestions and to explore conclusions.

August 2017

- 14th of August, First synthesized draft of paper to be turned in.

September – December 2017

- Review and secondary research based on the feedback from first draft.
- On bi-weekly bases, return feedback to Prof. Daniel. Provide one week downtime for Prof. Daniel to review. Take advantage of enrollment in Hist.496B course with Prof. Daniels, receive weekly feedback on project. Research to continue.
- October 15th, first completed draft due.
- November 15th. Due date for all materials.
Works Cited


40. Schwartz, Stuart B. :(ed.), *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting, and Reflecting on*
the Encounters between Europeans and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era
(Cambridge, 1994)


